# **Opportunities for Collaboration with DIII-D**

Our future plans, and thoughts on our common goals

presented by **RJ Buttery** with thanks to many DIII-D colleagues

Plasma Seminar 10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop Mar 22<sup>nd</sup> 2021





R.J. Buttery/10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop/Mar 2021 1



### Strong and Effective, Appreciated Partnership Between DIII-D & PRC

- Deep meaningful engagement on most important issues of fusion energy
- True partnership as equals with leadership opportunities on both sides
  - -Unique capabilities in each partner which inform each others path
  - -Shared project leads, invited talks, papers
- Leading to major advances that inform our path
  - -Reactor scenarios, transient control, current drive core-edge integration





### Our partnership has added enormous value to our research programs in the US and PRC



### **DIII-D has Re-Developed Operation for Remote Participation**

### DIII-D Control Room during operation, May 2020

### • New tools replicate the "control room experience"

- Team communication using Discord (gaming software!)
- Specialized web tools developed
- All meetings moved to Zoom
- Procedures to keep people safe when on-site
- Remote participation is easier!





Developing models of international collaboration and preparation for ITER and other facilities

# **DIII-D Plans and Opportunities**

### Research Needs

• Long Range Directions & DIII-D Mission – What is the potential of the facility

- Near Term Plans
  - Opportunities to Engage
- Conclusions





# Strong Focus Maintained on Enabling Success in ITER



### • DIII-D is the U.S.'s ITER simulator

- Relevant parameter, shape, physics & control

### Make ITER better

- Address transients & raise performance Q>10!
- Rapidly resolve ITER issues when running

### Validate techniques, theory & simulation

- Develop on DIII-D  $\rightarrow$  test on ITER
- Gain leadership. Develop tools for U.S. reactor

### Develop techniques, codes & personnel Bring learning back from ITER to U.S. program



# DIII-D also Targets Advanced Tokamak Path to a Compact Fusion Pilot Plant

- Fully integrated physics simulations project range of Compact AT pilot plant solutions
  - State of the art models validated on DIII-D
  - High shape, broad current, high pressure
    - High bootstrap self-driven solutions



Normalized radius





# **DIII-D also Targets Advanced Tokamak Path to a Compact Fusion Pilot Plant**

- Fully integrated physics simulations project range of Compact AT pilot plant solutions
  - State of the art models validated on DIII-D
  - High shape, broad current, high pressure
- Family of fully non-inductive solutions at R~4m, 200MWe



#### 200MW Net **Electric Solutions:**

	6T	<b>7</b> T
l I	9.4	8.1
q	4.9	6.5
$\beta_N$	4.2	3.6
H <sub>98</sub>	1.3	1.5
Q	10	17
P <sub>heat</sub>	84	38
P <sub>fus</sub>	870	660
Neut.	2.3	1.8

R=4m,  $\eta_{TH} = \eta_{CD} = 0.4$  $n_{\rho}^{ped}/n_{GW}$ =1, 200MWe

R.J. Buttery/10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop/Mar 2021 7

**κ=2** δ=0.6

350.00

250,01

1.00

### Pilot Plant Concept Poses Key Research Challenges

### Core solution needs development & physics validation

- -Scope the limits of density, pressure, confinement
- Turbulence, stability, energetic particle confinement
- Required control tools & safe landing (disruptions, ELMs)
- Viable current drive solution
- Power handling solution compatible with core
- Resolve wall materials and plasma interaction



- Compatibility between core and edge is the key challenge
- Develop the high pressure & density solutions needed for a fusion reactor

DIII-D aims to confront these challenges



# **DIII-D Plans and Opportunities**

- Research Needs
- Long Range Directions & DIII-D Mission – What is the potential of the facility
- Near Term Plans
  - Opportunities to Engage
- Conclusions





# Key Challenge for Pilot is to Identify Plasma Solution That Delivers the Performance and Handles the Power Loading

Core and divertor physics are governed by different parameters:





# Key Challenge for Pilot is to Identify Plasma Solution That Delivers the Performance and Handles the Power Loading

Core and divertor physics are governed by different parameters:





# Key Challenge for Pilot is to Identify Plasma Solution That Delivers the Performance and Handles the Power Loading

Core and divertor physics are governed by different parameters:





This is the central focus of DIII-D upgrades and mission

#### • Peeling-ballooning instability couples

- Fine scale ripple-like interchange
- Low order peel off of edge





### • Peeling-ballooning instability couples

- Fine scale ripple-like interchange
- Low order peel off of edge
- High shaping see drives separate in parameter space
  - Opens valley in pedestal stability







### Peeling-ballooning instability couples

- Fine scale ripple-like interchange
- Low order peel off of edge
- High shaping see drives separate in parameter space
  - Opens valley in pedestal stability







### Peeling-ballooning instability couples

- Fine scale ripple-like interchange
- Low order peel off of edge
- High shaping see drives separate in parameter space
  - Opens valley in pedestal stability
- Super H-Mode







#### • Peeling-ballooning instability couples

- Fine scale ripple-like interchange
- Low order peel off of edge
- High shaping see drives separate in parameter space
  - Opens valley in pedestal stability
- Super H-Mode discovered on DIII-D
  - Record  $\beta_{\text{N}}\text{=}3.1$  with a quiescent edge







- Raise shape, volume and current to open large expanse in operational space
  - Install a compact divertor





- Raise shape, volume and current to open large expanse in operational space
  - Install a compact divertor
- Opens region of high pressure and density
  - Explore limits of performance raising technique
- High pressure -> low collisionality at high density
  - Explore dissipative edge with high performance





- Raise shape, volume and current to open large expanse in operational space
  - Install a compact divertor
- Opens region of high pressure and density
  - Explore limits of performance raising technique
- High pressure → low collisionality at high density
  - Explore dissipative edge with high performance
- Increases opacity
  - Capture particle transport dynamic of a reactor





- Raise shape, volume and current to open large expanse in operational space
  - Install a compact divertor
- Opens region of high pressure and density
  - Explore limits of performance raising technique
- High pressure → low collisionality at high density
  - Explore dissipative edge with high performance
- Increases opacity
  - Capture particle transport dynamic of a reactor

Fundamentally transforms DIII-D capabilities to study core-edge interactions & solutions





# Shape Rise Part of Wider Performance Upgrade to Discover Reactor-Relevant Core-Edge Solutions

 Additional heating & current drive needed to explore the expanded operational space

- 20MW RF inc. high density current drive: Helicon, LHCD, ECH

- Steady states with x2 density, x3 energy ->
  - Relevant core: High thermal & bootstrap fraction, low rotation, coupled ions & electrons





# Shape Rise Part of Wider Performance Upgrade to Discover Reactor-Relevant Core-Edge Solutions

 Additional heating & current drive needed to explore the expanded operational space

- 20MW RF inc. high density current drive: Helicon, LHCD, ECH

Steady states with x2 density, x3 energy →

Relevant core: High thermal & bootstrap fraction, low rotation, coupled ions & electrons

- TF rise to 2.5T advances core-edge path further
   v\*~ B<sup>-4</sup>: Fully scope low v\* space to high density
  → ITER-like pedestal-core optimization
- Heat fluxes ~3GW/m<sup>2</sup> with high density
  - $\rightarrow$  Assess reactor relevant div/SOL processes







Dramatic change in physics capabilities to address pilot mission

# Performance and Closure Rise Enables DIII-D to Explore Reactor Divertor Solutions

### Closes gaps on key metrics governing physical mechanisms in divertor

- Closure raises local density & dissipation further

#### Key Divertor and Core-Edge Physics:

- Lyman  $\alpha$ : photon trapping by particles
- Ionization length: how far neutrals get compared to divertor structures
- **Recombination/ionization:** governs proportion of neutrals at the edge
- Fluidity: as divertor plasma becomes more fluid
- **Turbulence broadening:** at high heat fluxes radial gradients drive turbulence in scrape-off layer







# Performance and Closure Rise Enables DIII-D to Explore Reactor Divertor Solutions

- Closes gaps on key metrics governing physical mechanisms in divertor
  - Closure raises local density & dissipation further
- Utilize flexibility and diagnostics to discover reactor divertor solution
  - Variable physical and magnetic geometry
    - Stabilize high levels of detachment
  - Outstanding diagnostics & theory partnership
    - Resolve key physics
  - Relevant SOL/pedestal parameters and wall
    - Identify compatibility with fusion core







Unique basis to develop projectable understanding for reactor

### Plasma Wall Interaction is Critical in Overall Solution

### Goal: Assess materials in relevant conditions

- Qualify new materials in tokamak plasmas
- Resolve constraints on divertor and core
  - Physics of migration and transport
- Ensure suitable conditions for high performance
  - Radiative optimization (without carbon)





# Plasma Wall Interaction is Critical in Overall Solution

### Goal: Assess materials in relevant conditions

- Qualify new materials in tokamak plasmas
- Resolve constraints on divertor and core
  - Physics of migration and transport
- Ensure suitable conditions for high performance
  - Radiative optimization (without carbon)

# • Key Elements

- Tile Test facilities PMI with realistic tokamak plasma
- Tungsten divertor erosion and leakage
- Wall conditioning innovative/real time techniques
- SiC limiters/wall reduce carbon influx & PMI
  - SiC an exciting potential reactor material



### DIII-D can help establish compatibility of core-wall solution



### New Reactor Current Drive Techniques Being Pioneered to Access New Regimes and Develop Reactor Solutions

### Reactor Challenge

- High efficiency is key to net electric goal
- Reactor environment antenna survivability
- Effective coupling



### New Reactor Current Drive Techniques Being Pioneered to Access New Regimes and Develop Reactor Solutions

### Reactor Challenge

- High efficiency is key to net electric goal
- Reactor environment antenna survivability
- Effective coupling

### DIII-D Approach

- Innovative launch: traveling wave, HFS, top
- High density current drive: helicon, LHCD, EC





### New Reactor Current Drive Techniques Being Pioneered to Access New Regimes and Develop Reactor Solutions

### Reactor Challenge

- High efficiency is key to net electric goal
- Reactor environment antenna survivability
- Effective coupling

### DIII-D Approach

- Innovative launch: traveling wave, HFS, top
- High density current drive: helicon, LHCD, EC

### Transforms Capabilities

- Steady states at high density & low rotation
- Raises  $\beta_N$  limits
- Viable schemes for a reactor







Modest investments at DIII-D can resolve critical questions for pilot

### New Control Techniques Being Pioneered to Eliminate Transients Events in ITER and Beyond

- Utilize 3D flexibility to resolve the 3D optimization of the tokamak to control transients
  - Probe the physics and understand requirements for stability, rotation and ELM control







### New Control Techniques Being Pioneered to Eliminate Transients Events in ITER and Beyond

# • Utilize 3D flexibility to resolve the 3D optimization of the tokamak to control transients

 Probe the physics and understand requirements for stability, rotation and ELM control

### Test novel solutions

- Edge-friendly negative triangularity scenarios
- New pellet and runaway mitigation schemes







### New Control Techniques Being Pioneered to Eliminate Transients Events in ITER and Beyond

# • Utilize 3D flexibility to resolve the 3D optimization of the tokamak to control transients

 Probe the physics and understand requirements for stability, rotation and ELM control

### Test novel solutions

- Edge-friendly negative triangularity scenarios
- New pellet and runaway mitigation schemes

### Disruption free protocol

- Combine ML, active sensing & real time control for robust avoidance & safe quenching
  - In 40% of shots this year

### Flexible: try new things quickly Powerful: qualify in relevant regimes









### Proposed Upgrades Combine to Address the Core-Edge Challenge





### Proposed Upgrades Combine to Address the Core-Edge Challenge





### Proposed Upgrades Combine to Address the Core-Edge Challenge



Discover the solutions needed for ITER & Pilot Plant



# **DIII-D Plans and Opportunities**

Research Needs

• Long Range Directions & DIII-D Mission – What is the potential of the facility

- Near Term Plans
  - Opportunities to Engage
- Conclusions





# DIII-D FY21-22 Research Addresses High Priority Issues for ITER & Lays the Foundation for the Fusion Pilot Program



### • Key Priorities in 2021

- Hydrogen campaign for ITER
- Disruption free protocol
- Helicon Commissioning
- Pedestal understanding, divertor optimization & core-edge integration
- ITER scenarios & control

# • Upgrades in 2022-23

- Revised slot divertor with Tungsten
- New helium liquefier
- HFS LHCD
- Negative triangularity armor
- New 2D/3D power supply



# Generate Basis for Reactor Disruption Mitigation System and Demonstrate Path for Disruption-Free Operation

### Continue innovation to establish credible DMS design

- Verify adequacy of SPI for ITER DMS
  - INC: Camera & bolometry upgrades
- Pursue reactor-relevant alternatives to SPI
  - INC: Magnetically shielded shell pellet
- New solutions for runaway electron control
  - INC: Passive runaway deconfinement coil design
- Must demonstrate robust solutions to finalize requirements for ITER & CPP
- Developing new methods for disruption-free operation





Machine learning for disruption avoidance & detection



#### Disruption-free protocol



R.J. Buttery/10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop/Mar 2021 39







# Second New Power Supply Through ASIPP Collaboration Significantly Enhances 3D Control and 2D Shaping



- SSPA#1 commissioned and in routine use
- Supplies provide:
  - Greater flexibility for 3D magnetic spectra
  - Improved 2D shaping capabilities for new divertor and ITER research
- Procurement of 2<sup>nd</sup> supply underway order placed for late FY21 installation
- Building expansion will be provided by GA
- Patch panel (expansion) by PPPL



### Major capability for transient and core-edge missions



## Helicon: 1 MW Higher Efficiency Off-Axis Current Drive Currently being commissioned



- Antenna installation completed
- Ex-vessel components installed with commissioning beginning in late 2020
  - Klystron conditioned up to 1MW RF output power.
  - Antenna conditioning with hundreds of MW applied in progress
- Strong coupling to plasma observed,
  >80% of power incident on first module
  - Coupled power responds both to density changes during L-H/H-L transitions, and to changes in outer gap



# SAS-1V – A Small Change in Tile Profile Tests Prediction of Improved Divertor Closure



**Upper SAS Divertor** 

- SAS-1V design in FY20; procure FY20/21; install FY21 vent with SAS-1W (tungsten)
- Diagnostic Enhancements (spectroscopy, density, temperature)



# Tungsten in SAS-1 Slot Will Enable Study of High-Z Leakage from a Closed Divertor



- 1 row of Tungsten coated tiles will be installed in the FY21 vent.
- Tiles will remain in vessel for FY21/22 experimental campaign
- Experiment is compatible with proposed SAS-1V shape
- Diagnostic Enhancements (spectroscopy)



# High Power, Diverted Negative Triangularity Discharges Show High Confinement, Significant $\beta_N$ and ELM-free L-mode Edge



- No ELMs L-mode edge with up to 5x  $P_{L-H}$ , high-confinement and up to  $\beta_N$ =3.0
  - Combination of shape-induced effects that weaken turbulent transport
  - Only got H-mode at less negative triangularity
- Promising candidate for core-edge integration
  - Robustly ELM-free with divertor at large R
  - Broad  $\lambda_{\textrm{q}}$  and low  $\textrm{P}_{\textrm{Sep}}$



# Negative Triangularity – Temporary Installation of Armor in FY22 Will Enable Strikepoint on Outer Wall and Protect Diagnostics



R.J. Buttery/10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop/Mar 2021 45

### High Field Side Lower Hybrid Current Drive System in Preparation for Operation during FY23 Campaign

- Ex-vessel installation in progress
- In-vessel components being prepared for installation in Summer 2022 vent
  - New manufacturing techniques
  - Novel copper alloy, GRCop-84 to meet challenging disruption loads and thermal requirements
  - 3D printing, assembling and finishing techniques







**Boost Transformer foundation** 





LHV water system Installation

In-vessel designs complete, fabrication in progress



# Principle Near Term Foci at DIII-D Continue to Prioritize Joint US-PRC Interests

### Key physics priorities

- -Pioneer physics basis and techniques for integrated core-edge solutions
- -Resolution of transient control (disruptions and ELMs)
- -High performance fusion core
- -Innovative heating and current drive
- Develop assess and project power handling solutions

### Key partnerships

- Joint EAST-DIII-D Task Force remains a top priority management level initiative
  - Collaborative experiments with EAST & DIII-D complement each other
  - New opportunities with HL-2M would be welcomed
- -Development on new hardware & physics approaches (3D, helicon, ...)
- -Focus on design and requirements of new facilities in US and China



Our continued partnership provides great opportunities to advance our research programs in the US and PRC

GENERAL ATOMICS

### Strong and Effective, Appreciated Partnership Between DIII-D & PRC

- Deep meaningful engagement on most important issues of fusion energy
- True partnership as equals with leadership opportunities on both sides
  - Unique capabilities in each partner which inform each others path
  - -Shared project leads, invited talks, papers
- Leading to major advances that inform our path
  - Reactor scenarios, transient control, current drive core-edge integration



Our continued partnership provides great opportunities to advance our research programs in the US and PRC





# BONUS MATERIAL



R.J. Buttery/10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop/Mar 2021 49

# Longer Range, we are Exploring Options to Close Gaps on the Fusion Pilot Plant

- Path identified to reactor physics regimes
  - Increase shaping, field & current drive to raise energy and density
  - Closed divertor for power handling to raise local density and radiate heat
  - New wall materials to reduce impurities
    & test compatibility of reactor solutions

### Reactor-relevant core & edge simultaneously

- Raises pressure & density in steady states
- Find techniques and technologies that work

Flexibility & relevance to find core to edge physics solutions & project to reactor





### Recent and Planned Facility Enhancements Strengthen Core and Boundary/PMI Research

	Facility Upgrades	Research Goals	
Core Plasma	Co-Counter NB	Increased co- power for high $\beta$ scenarios, Increased power with balanced torque Low rotation high $\beta$ SS scenarios	
	Helicon/ HFS Lower Hybrid Top Launch EC, CCOANBI	High efficiency off-axis current drive at higher density	
	Expanded EC	Increase Te/Ti; Zero-torque H&CD Off-axis j(r); NTM stabilization; Perturbative transport	
	NB Pulse/Power Extension	T $\longrightarrow 2$ R; Higher $\beta$ scenarios	
Boundary/PMI	New 2D/3D Power Supplies, New 3D coils	Improved divertor shaping RMP and 3D physics	
	Divertor Geometry Modification	Heat flux and density control; detachment physics	
	Divertor diagnostics, LBO, pedestal Lyα arrays	Dissipative physics, SOL flows and momentum, turbulence and transport, fueling, impurity xport	
	W inserts & PFCs tests	Understand sources and develop mitigation techniques	

# DIII-D Developing Scientific and Technical Basis for Robust ELM-Control Solutions for ITER and Steady-state Reactors

#### **DIII-D Strengths and Capabilities Include**

- Broad set of actuators
- Wide range in pedestal collisionality
- Comprehensive diagnostic set
- Close connection to theory
- Expand operating space for ELM-free regimes, including negative triangularity
- New M-coils (FY23) and second PS will provide more spectral flexibility and better match to ITER
  - Explore Quasi-symmetric optimizations possible collaboration opportunity with stellarator community
- ELM pacing with impurity granules or fuel pellets

#### 2<sup>nd</sup> 3D P/S & New 3D coils



#### **Rotation Control**



#### **ELM-free Regimes**









### Steady State Path is Easier than the Pulsed Tokamak

### Current is the key challenge for the tokamak

- $-\beta$ ~few % most energy in electromagnetic channel
- Drives narrow heat flux width challenging divertor

### Advanced tokamak improves stability & transport

- -High shaping, high beta, broad current profiles
- -Permits high safety factor / low current approach
  - Attributes demonstrated in world's tokamaks

### Meets key requirements of pilot plant

- Eliminates disruptions
- Achieves high confinement key for compactness
- Enables stationery solutions, without cycling to reduce stresses & required size



### Reduces cost, size risk, raises performance



DIII-D #176440



R.J. Buttery/10<sup>th</sup> US-PRC Workshop/Mar 2021 53

### Silicon Carbide PFCs may enable reduction of C impurity content and increase of core performance

# • SiC PFCs decrease impurity sourcing relative to graphite

- Total erosion yield decreased by order of magnitude at low C impurity fraction
- More pronounced decrease for detached conditions (low T<sub>e,div</sub>)
- Effect mostly due to low chemical sputtering yield of SiC
- SiC may substantially decrease core radiation relative to graphite
  - Factor of 2 decrease in Prad at low T<sub>e</sub> and low C impurity fraction
- SiC could represent significant benefit for DIII-D by enabling a more reactorrelevant impurity mix

Predicted Impurity Source & Radiated Power, Graphite vs. Silicon Carbide



Abrams NF 2020, internal review



### **Broad Current Profile Ensures Fusion Products Stay Confined**

- Potential for Alfvénic resonances in weak magnetic shear regions
  - Overlapping modes lead to transport





# Fuel dilution due to core radiation remains a challenge for all DEMO concepts

 As core impurity fraction is increased, higher Z<sub>eff</sub> drives down fuel ion fraction

$$f_i = 1 - 2f_{He} - Z_{imp}f_{imp}, \qquad P_{fus} \propto f_i^2 n^2 T^2 V_p$$

- even a small change in  $f_i$  dramatically reduces fusion power
- Kallenbach et. al. have predicted impurity profiles for a R = 9m, a = 2.25m DEMO
  - scaling to C-AT DEMO parameters results in a 60% reduction in fusion power, 2x more than the 33% assumed in this study
  - $f_{Kr} = 1 \times 10^{-2}$  needed for 172 MW of core radiation
- a radiative model is needed in GASC to ensure self-consistancy





# Power Handling Challenge Benefits from Advanced Tokamak Approach with Low Recirculating Power

- Power escaping plasma: P<sub>Separatrix</sub> = P<sub>alpha heat</sub> + P<sub>H&CD</sub> P<sub>brems/synch/line radn</sub>
  - Goes into layer,  $\lambda_q = 1.35 B_{\theta}^{-0.92} \varepsilon^{0.42} P_{SOL}^{-0.02} R_0^{0.04}$ , which is  $\propto 1 / B_{\theta}$ - Leads to poloidal heat flux  $\mathbf{q}_{\theta} \sim \mathbf{P}_{SOL} \mathbf{B}_{\theta} / \mathbf{N} \mathbf{R}$
- Map power to flux along field line  $(B_{\theta} / B_T)$ :  $q_{\parallel} \sim P_{SOL} B_T / N R$ 
  - If power dissipates on tiles, key challenge metric is  ${f q}_{\parallel}$
  - If power must be radiated, then connection length plays role  $(B_T / B_\theta)^X$  introducing  $B_\theta^X$  again:  $\mathbf{q}_\theta^X \mathbf{q}_{\parallel}^{(1-X)}$ 
    - > Bracket problem with  $q_{\parallel}$  and  $q_{\theta} \leftarrow$  divertor challenge metrics

### Increase core radiation to reduce divertor challenge metric

- Match ITER  $\mathbf{q}_{\parallel}$  with 50% radiation  $\mathbf{b}$  Both maintain good pedestal
- Match ITER  $\mathbf{q}_{\theta}$  with 20% radiation  $\int$  with pedestal power flux,  $\mathbf{P}_{SOL}$
- But steady state reactor may need to go further





Low recycling power & double divertor alleviates heat flux challenge

### Structure Appears Viable Though Requires Advanced Approach for Stress Handling

- Requires advanced bucking approach to deal with forces (like ARC)
  - 'Buck' toroidal field coil forces off solenoid
    & central plug to cancel out stress by >50%
- Project 4m leaves sufficient space for breeding, shielding, toroidal field coil & solenoid

Still challenging engineering requiring research





# Higher Field High T<sub>C</sub> Superconductors Offer Advantages for Maintenance & Testing Program

# • High Temperature Superconductors potentially enable demountability

 Enables wall to be rapidly changed for nuclear science mission

### • Propose staged approach:

- Net electric demonstration

then

- Long pulse for materials & breeding tests

HTS enables facility to combine net electric and nuclear science mission

#### EXAMPLE: Vertical change out scheme in Japanese SN design (C-AT is DN)





[Utoh, Fus. Eng. Des. 2017]